

Audience: Editorial Review Board

Purpose: Provide details of a review of a submission, and a recommended decision, by a reviewer.

| <b>EABOK Submission Review Form</b>   |  |
|---|--|
| Title of Paper  |  |
| Author/POC  |  |
| Reviewer  |  |
| Recommendation  | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept<br><input type="checkbox"/> Accept with modifications**<br><input type="checkbox"/> Reject |
| Overall Rating  |  |
| Rate the submission on the following six major content criteria, on a scale of 1 (not at all) to 5 (very much so).  |  |
| <p>_____ A. Does it appear to follow the submission guidelines?</p> <p>_____ B. Does it fit the EABOK scope?</p> <p>_____ C. Is it technically sound?</p> <p>_____ D. Does it provide useful information to EABOK users?</p> <p>_____ E. Does it satisfy requirements for objectivity, professionalism, etc.?</p> <p>_____ F. Does it apply to the selected knowledge area, topic and type?</p> |  |
| Comments (be specific regarding recommended modifications)  |  |
|   |  |

**Submission Review Criteria**

The tables that follow provide detailed elements for each respective criterion. These elements should form the basis of the overall rating on Page 1. These details are for the use and benefit of the Editorial Review Board; they are not shared with the author(s).

| <b>Criterion A. Does it appear to follow the submission guidelines?</b> |   |  |
|---|---|--|
| Criterion Element   | Criterion Element Expansion   | Y/N  |
| No proprietary information  | Has the author ensured either (1) that their BOK submissions do <b>not</b> contain proprietary or restricted information, or (2) if their BOK material is proprietary, that they have permission from their organization to post it or to put references or links to it on the EABOK website? | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No<br>Comment: |
| Language – English  |   | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No<br>Comment: |
| Writing style   | Succinct and to the point. Proper grammar, spelling, paragraph structure, and phrasing.   | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No<br>Comment: |
| Document format   | Submitted in PDF or Word  | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No<br>Comment: |
| Length  | Reasonable length   | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No<br>Comment: |
| Link to external  | All links functional, relevant  | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No<br>Comment: |
| Reference style   | APA style ( <a href="http://www.apastyle.org">www.apastyle.org</a> ). See EABOK Submission Guidelines for details.  | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No<br>Comment: |

| <b>Criterion B. Does it fit the EABOK scope?</b> |   |  |
|--|---|--|
| Criterion Element                                | Criterion Element Expansion   | Y/N  |
| Is within scope of EABOK                         | Fits in one or more EABOK knowledge areas and topics; if not, fits in EA and has a valid argument for adding a knowledge area or topic. | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No<br>Comment: |
| Represents general practice or knowledge         | Presents knowledge that is practical/useful   | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No<br>Comment: |
| Is useful to current practice                    | Usefulness should not be diminished due to out-of-date material. The material can be used if it is necessary for historical purposes.   | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No<br>Comment: |

| <b>Criterion C. Is it technically sound?</b> |  |  |
|--|--|--|
| Criterion Element                            | Criterion Element Expansion  | Y/N  |
| Credible                                     | Is the article internally correct and error-free? Is the treatment of the topic at a high level of expertise?  | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No<br>Comment: |
| Well-grounded                                | If an analysis, method, or pattern, is it based on a sufficient body of practice or experience?<br>If a research result, is the research method or approach adequate and clear, and are the results related to other research and knowledge?<br>--If case study or sample artifact, is the case or project realistic and representative? | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No<br>Comment: |
| Does not presume specific situation          | Is it generalizable to frequently encountered situations and to a broad audience?  | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No<br>Comment: |

| <b>Criterion C. Is it technically sound?</b>      |  |  |
|---|--|--|
| Criterion Element                                 | Criterion Element Expansion  | Y/N  |
| Sufficient and complete                           | Does it explain everything needed to make its point?   | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No<br>Comment: |
| Readable  | Is it sufficiently readable? Does it have an appropriate balance between readability and technical excellence? | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No<br>Comment: |
| Consistent / can integrate with the rest of EABOK | Do the "edges" fit in with other EA material? Overlap, cross-reference, consistency.                           | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No<br>Comment: |

| <b>Criterion D. Does it provide useful information to EABOK users?</b> |   |  |
|--|---|--|
| Criterion Element  | Criterion Element Expansion   | Y/N  |
| Contribution is useful   | Does it offer a useful EA-related analysis, case study, method, pattern, research result, or sample artifact? | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No<br>Comment: |
| Contribution is needed   | Is there a need for material like this in the EA community?   | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No<br>Comment: |

| <b>Criterion E. Does it satisfy requirements for objectivity, professionalism, etc.?</b> |   |  |
|--|---|--|
| Criterion Element  | Criterion Element Expansion   | Y/N  |
| Non-marketing  | Is the content independent material, not motivated by selling a product or service? | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No<br>Comment: |

**Criterion E. Does it satisfy requirements for objectivity, professionalism, etc.?**

| Criterion Element | Criterion Element Expansion  | Y/N  |
|-------------------|--|--|
| Objectivity       | Are the views well supported by data and objective analysis?   | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No<br>Comment: |
| Professionalism   | Does the content represent general practice? If it expresses a view or opinion, is it based on observation and experience, is it done in a professional manner, and is it tactful in discussing other views (e.g., authors, organizations, publications, methods)? | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No<br>Comment: |

**Criterion F. Does it apply to the selected knowledge area, topic, and type?**

| Criterion Element  | Criterion Element Expansion | Y/N   |
|--|-----------------------------|---|
| Does it apply to the selected knowledge area? If not, should it be applied elsewhere, or should a new knowledge area be created? |                             | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No<br>Knowledge area: |
| Does it apply to the selected topic? If not, does it apply elsewhere, or should a new topic be created?                          |                             | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No<br>Topic:          |